

Review Criteria by NERL PDE	Evaluation Questions	NERL Preferences
Transparency		
Author affiliation criteria explicitly defined (i.e., ROAR IDs)	Does the agreement define use of a standard institutional identifier, and if so, which identifier(s)? Are these identifiers commonly used by NERL members?	of institutional identifiers. Affiliation based on email is an acceptable second option.
Pricing/Fee Structure is/can be made public	Does the agreement allow for it and its pricing model to be made publicly available, such as in the ESAC Initiative directory?	
Sustainability		
Rational and Consistent Pricing	Does the pricing model make rational sense across all members of the consortium? Is the cost structure reflective of the research output and financial limitations of each consortium member?	NERL Core Members strongly prefer agreements that demonstrate a decrease in cost over time as more content becomes open.
Simple Cost Model	Is the pricing model more complex than necessary, or does it do what it's meant to do in a reasonable and effective manner?	allow unused funds to roll over to an additional year OR to be shared amongst consortia members.
Author retains copyright	Does the agreement ask the author to sign an exclusive transfer of copyright to publish?	NERL Core Members strongly prefer that the agreement terms allow authors to retain copyright in their work.
Cost neutral? Caps on Spend?	Will implementation of the agreement increase the expected annual cost for this resource to each institution? If any pricing is based on a variable, such as the number of articles published by the institution's authors, then is there any defined limit, either on the cost to the institution or the number of allowed articles from the institution's authors? When a cap is in place, does it allow un-used funds to roll over to the next year?	NERL Core Members strongly prefer agreements without caps on publishing spend; we also strongly prefer agreements that are cost neutral.
Publisher's transition plan to fully open is defined; Impact of transition on pricing over time is defined	Does the publisher have a stated commitment and timetable for converting to a fully OA publishing plan? Does the publisher define how that plan will impact its pricing in future years? Will the overall fees remain stable with a shift away from Read fees towards Publishing fees? Does the publisher misuse the term "Transformative Agreement", using it as a catchall term for a Read & Publish agreement, rather than a meaningful conversion to a fully OA publishing structure?	NERL Core Members strongly prefer agreements that require publishers to issue publication statistics at the institutional level; we strongly prefer agreements that include a roadmap outlining how the publisher is transitioning to fully open publishing practices.
Equity		
Author's retention of copyright	<i>Same as above for "Author retains copyright"</i>	NERL Core Members strongly prefer that the agreement terms allow authors to retain copyright in their work.
Is participation equitably available to all institutions regardless of resource size?	Does the agreement provide a balanced approach to participation for all institutions, regardless of their size or budget? Can every institution reasonably expect to be able to participate, if they choose?	
Opt-in or Full Consortial Deal? Minimum number of participants? Minimum publication volume total?	If there is a minimum level of institutional participation, do we consider it to be reasonable? And is there enough time for institutions to still implement individual subscriptions if the minimum is not met?	
Full coverage of content is clearly defined	Does the agreement, or its associated documentation, clearly lay out the amount of content that subscribing institutions will be able to access? Are access and authentication paths (i.e., EZproxy, SSO, SeamlessAccess, etc.) clearly defined and easily implemented?	NERL Core Members strongly prefer agreements that cover all APC journals (both hybrid and fully open).

Reproducibility		
Coverage - Includes fully open journals or hybrid only?	If agreements do not include all journals from the publisher, do they sufficiently explain why? How will the publisher identify the journals that will have APCs paid for? How will the publisher explain this on behalf of the library?	NERL Core Members strongly prefer agreements that cover all APC journals (both hybrid and fully open).
CC-License specified	Does the author have a choice of Creative Commons License?	NERL Core Members strongly prefer that open access articles are published under a CC License.
Limitations on article type (Research Articles only? All articles?); For ineligible article types, the publisher has provided a clear and specific explanation	Does the contract limit OA options to just certain types of articles? If so, is the publisher clear about these different types? Is there any confusion on the part of someone reading the contract about limitations on OA publications?	NERL Core Members strongly prefer agreements that cover all article types that require an APC.
Flexibility		
Multi-payer options? (internal and external; library vs. grant funds)	Can the vendor support split billing to different departments within the university, if requested?	It is preferable for some but not all NERL Core Members to have the ability to invoice multiple business units within an institution; it is preferable for all NERL Core Members that that costs can be split across multiple institutions (NERL and non-NERL); any multi-payer model implemented at NERL should in no way place additional burden on library staff for implementation.
Workflow administrative burden to library/institution	What does the workflow look like for approving OA articles? Does each article require an approval from a university or library representative? Are articles approved automatically? How much work should a library representative expect to dedicate to managing the OA publishing process with this vendor?	
Workflow administrative burden to the author	How much work should an author expect to dedicate to selecting an OA publication option under this agreement? How much documentation/support does the vendor provide for authors making these elections?	
		NERL Core Members strongly prefer author affiliation workflows that are automated.